Singing from the Heart: 
The Musical Utopias of the Moravian Church
Sarah Eyerly

“The Brothers were one heart and one soul. In their worship and in their private gatherings, one felt an unaffected simplicity, truly a godly wisdom. Their Singstunden were harmonies not only of voices, but also of the heart and the spirit. For all eternity, I will never forget what I saw in their company.”

August Gottlieb Spangenberg, written in 1730 after a visit to the Moravian community of Herrnhut, Germany

The Moravian church was a central institution in German culture throughout the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, attracting such converts and devotees as Goethe, Novalis, Herder, and Schleiermacher. Indeed, no history of German culture during this period can be considered complete without an examination of the history of the Moravian church and its charismatic founder, Count Nikolaus Ludwig von Zinzendorf. On his estate in Sachsen, Germany, Zinzendorf founded “Herrnhut,” an eclectic, utopian commune formed of religious refugees from Hapsburg-controlled Bohemia and Moravia, and German Lutherans seeking a deeper spirituality than the current Pietist movement could offer.

Thanks to a travel grant from the Eugene K. Wolf Travel Fund for European Research, I traveled to Herrnhut in the summer of 2004 to investigate the rich musical culture of the Moravian church during the mid-eighteenth century. The communal way of life at Herrnhut fostered intense religious devotion and the memorization of large quantities of devotional poetry and music. For the Moravians, hymnody and music became the most visible and frequent expression of theology. Congregational singing was regarded as the highest form of worship, linking one directly with the Holy Spirit through the heart, without mediation by the mind. Music was central to daily life, and community members sang together not only when they worshipped, but throughout the day—in work, prayer, contemplation, and conversation. When any event of note happened in the community, a song was composed. Moravians described themselves as “living in song.”

The earliest distinctive form of Moravian liturgical music, the Singstunde [singing hour], was based on a foundation of several thousand memorized hymns. Individual verses and parts of hymns would be combined extemporaneously by a congregational leader, and repeated by the congregation, to create a Liederpredigt [hymn-sermon] which would elaborate upon the gospel text for the particular day. If no suitable hymn verses could be drawn from the memorized repertory, the leader would improvise a new hymn. This practice was referred to as “singing from the heart,” and was seen as outward evidence of a person’s commitment to the religious community. An individual’s ability to spontaneously improvise new hymns, or to draw upon the memorized repertory to create new sequences of verses from existing hymns was highly prized by the Moravians, for improvisation gave voice to the divine.

During the period of 1741–1750, described in Moravian historiography as the Sifting Time, the poetry created for use in the Singstunden became more and more extravagant. Special code words and invented linguistic devices characterized the desires of worshippers to transmogrify into “little bees” which creep into the side wound of Christ. The Sifting Time came abruptly to an end in 1750, when the excesses of the period became too much even for Zinzendorf, and he issued a decree that effectively stifled current worship practices. This period is considered an embarrassment to the modern Moravian church and is little discussed. It was also around 1750 that the Singstunde migrated from an improvised practice to a practice that was notated. Music notation was used to record typical versions of the Singstunden, and these notated versions were used in actual worship services. The earlier improvisatory practice gradually declined and, according to previous scholarship on the subject, it was thought impossible to reconstruct. However, during my tenure at the Unitätsarchiv der Evangelischen Brüder-Unität (Unity-Archives of the Moravian Church) in Herrnhut, I uncovered mid-eighteenth-century documents that make reconstruction possible, both from a textual and a musical standpoint.

The improvisatory Singstunde tradition is well documented in contemporary sources contained in the Herrnhut archive. However, although the Moravian church is known for its exhaustive record-keeping (including daily community journals of life and
From the Editor

The SECM newsletter is published twice yearly, in October and April, and includes items of interest to its membership. Submissions in the following categories are encouraged:

- news of recent accomplishments from members of the society (publications, presentations, awards, performances, promotions, etc.)
- reviews of performances of eighteenth-century music
- reviews of books, editions, or recordings of eighteenth-century music
- conference reports
- dissertations in progress on eighteenth-century music
- upcoming conferences and meetings
- calls for papers and manuscripts
- research resources
- grant opportunities

Contributions should be submitted as an attachment to an e-mail (preferably in Microsoft Word) to Margaret Butler, SECM newsletter editor, at mbutler@music.ua.edu. Submissions must be received by July 1 for the October issue and by January 1 for the April issue. Claims for missing issues of the newsletter must be requested within six months of publication. Annotated discographies (in format given in inaugural issue, October 2002) will also be accepted and will be posted on the SECM web site.

SECM Officers
Sterling Murray, President; Bertil van Boer, Vice-President; Mara Parker, Secretary-Treasurer

SECM Board of Directors
Margaret Butler, Dexter Edge, Emily Green, Mark Knoll, Steven Zohn

SECM Honorary Members

Call for Papers
SECM Second Biennial Conference
Williamsburg 2006

The second biennial conference of the Society for Eighteenth-Century Music will be held 21–23 April 2006 in Williamsburg, Virginia. The theme for the meeting is “Genre in Eighteenth-Century Music.” We encourage proposals for papers focusing on genre and related issues, especially how genres developed in theory and practice during the eighteenth century. In addition, there will be at least one “free” session, during which topics concerning music and music-making in colonial America would be appropriate, and one session for project reports.

Proposals should be approximately 250 words, and only one submission per author will be considered. Papers should be limited to 20 minutes. The program committee will also accept proposals for two- or three-paper sessions on collaborative or related topics. Project reports should briefly describe research or a work in progress. Preference will be given to those authors who did not present a paper at the 2004 conference in Washington, DC.

Please submit your abstract by e-mail to pcorneilson@comcast.net. Be sure to include your name, address or institution, telephone, and e-mail address in the body of the message. All submissions will be acknowledged by return e-mail. Or mail your abstract to Paul Corneilson, Chair, SECM Program Committee, 11A Mt. Auburn Street, Cambridge, MA 02138. Deadline for submissions is 15 September 2005. Authors of accepted papers will be notified by the end of October. For further information, see the Society’s Web site www.secm.org.

Members’ News


Margaret Butler and John Rice presented papers at the international conference “Bearbeitungspraxis in der Oper des späten 18. Jahrhunderts,” sponsored by the Joseph Haydn-Institut and the University of Würzburg, in Würzburg, Germany, 18–20 February 2005.


Acknowledgments

The Society wishes to thank Robert T. Stroker, Dean, Boyer College of Music and Dance of Temple University, and Timothy Blair, Dean, College of Visual and Performing Arts, School of Music, West Chester University, West Chester, Pennsylvania for their generous financial support of the SECM newsletter.


Alvaro Ribeiro is spending the year as the visiting Donald I. MacLean, S. J. Professor of Arts and Sciences at Saint Joseph’s University in Philadelphia.


Upcoming Conferences and Calls for Papers

The fifth Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain Conference will be held in Nottingham 7–10 July 2005. A preliminary announcement and call for papers will be issued soon. For more information please contact Philip Olleson at Philip.Olleson@nottingham.ac.uk.


The Twelfth Annual Conference of the Italian Musicological Society will take place in Pesaro 21–23 October 2005. For more information and call for papers (deadline 15 June) please consult www.sidm.it.

The Mozart Society of America, which will again hold its annual meeting in conjunction with the AMS meeting in Washington, D.C., seeks proposals for presentations at the study session. Abstracts of studies, either completed or in progress, which deal with any aspect of Mozart’s life and work, or with the context of the later eighteenth century that can illuminate that work should be sent by June 15, 2005, to Jane R. Stevens, 3084 Cranbrook Ct., La Jolla, CA 92037, or e-mail to jrstevens@ucsd.edu.

The Mozart Society of America’s third biennial conference will take place 10–12 February 2006 at Indiana University, Bloomington. The conference, entitled “Mozart’s Choral Music: Composition, Contexts, Performance,” will include scholarly and practical presentations, performances, and exhibits, all focusing on Mozart’s writing for chorus in all its various aspects: sources, analysis, church and theatrical contexts, and performance practice. Send a one-page abstract (with name and contact information) by 15 July 2005 to Bruce Alan Brown, Thornton School of Music, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA 90089-0851; e-mail: brucebro@usc.edu.

Report on the Annual Meeting of the Società Italiana di Musicologia

Lecce, Italy, October 2004

Anthony R. DelDonna

The eleventh annual convention of the Società Italiana di Musicologia took place October 22–24, 2004 at the Monastero degli Olivetani in Lecce, Italy. The conference was organized by the society in collaboration with the Università degli Studi di Lecce, la Facoltà di Beni Culturali and il Dipartimento dei Bene delle Arti e della Storia among other sponsors. In opening remarks to welcome members of the society, Prof. Bianca Maria Antolini (President of SIDM) noted the considerable diversity of the scheduled presentations and the participation of scholars from beyond Italy, including individuals from Germany, Spain, Greece, France, Japan, and the United States.

The conference was organized into six consecutive sessions (with liberal intervals) on varying themes offering as many as seven presentations respectively. Although no single session was dedicated exclusively to eighteenth century studies, there were a number of papers focused on and/or correlative to the topic. For example, Antonio Dell’Olio’s presentation “Per una indagine sulle cappelle musicali in Puglia durante il secolo XVIII” offered an historical overview and institutional profile of the various religious musical establishments (whether monasteries, convents, or churches themselves) active in the Southern region of Puglia. Of particular interest was the use of archival materials such as employment contracts and financial records to illuminate the sociological context of the musical activities and individuals engaged by these institutions. Dell’Olio also documented the presence of women in contemporary practices and identified several who attained the status of “maestro di cappella.” Also featured on this session was Antonio Caroccia (Biblioteca del Conservatorio San Pietro a Majella in Naples), who offered a summary of the contributions of Guido Gasperini, among others, in his paper “L’aurora della musicologia italiana (1908–1942).” Although Caroccia’s presentation focused on the creation of a contemporary association of musicology in the early twentieth century, it did illuminate the rationale and method of approach toward preserving and subsequently publishing the extensive Italian musical patrimony of the eighteenth (and nineteenth) centuries.

The exportation of Italian music in the eighteenth century was also addressed in several presentations. Gian Giacomo Stiffoni’s paper “Nuove notizie sulla attività nel teatro de Los Caños del Peral della compagnia d’opera italiana dei teatri de Reales Sitos nel 1776” documented the return of Italian comic opera to Madrid by a company formed under the direction of the renowned baritone Francesco Benucci. Stiffoni’s meticulous scrutiny of notary records provided details regarding the composition of the company (whether singers, dancers, instrumentalists) and the illumination of production and organizational norms for the enterprise. In addition, Stiffoni addressed the sociological conditions that effected the presentation of Italian opera in Madrid and the rapport between audiences and this non-native form of entertainment. On the same session, Kostantinos Kardamis’s presentation, “The Nobile Teatro continued on page 12
The Susan Burney Letters Project

Philip Olleson

The letter-journals of Susan Burney (1755–1800) are an important and as yet comparatively little-known source of information on music and musicians in England in the late eighteenth century. Susan was the third of Dr. Charles Burney’s daughters, two-and-a-half years younger than her better-known sister, the novelist Frances (Fanny) Burney. She grew up in London, where she was able to observe at close quarters the musical life of the capital and to meet the many musicians, men of letters, and artists who visited the family home. As the most musically knowledgeable of the Burney children, she was exceptionally close to her father. She was also close to Frances, the singer Pacchierotti remarking to them that “there [is] but one soul—but one mind between you—you are two in one.”

In late 1780 she met Molesworth Phillips (1755–1832), a Royal Marines officer and a shipmate of her elder brother, and married him in January 1782. Their marriage was an unhappy one, and by the mid-1790s it had all but collapsed. In 1795 Phillips went to Ireland, but later returned to London and demanded that Susan join him. Much against her will, she acquiesced. At Belcotton, Ireland, Susan found a cold, damp farmhouse almost entirely lacking in amenities. Here, cut off from her family, virtually abandoned by her husband, and in deteriorating health, she lived until almost the end of her life. By 1799, her family, realizing the full gravity of her situation, persuaded Phillips to allow her to return home to England. She survived the sea crossing, but died just a few days after her arrival.

Like her sister Frances, Susan Burney was an inveterate correspondent. Her letter-journals, most of which are addressed to Frances, date from three main periods in her life: 1779–80, before her marriage, when she was still living in the family home; 1787–90, when she was largely occupied with her young family; and 1795–9, during the final, unhappy, period of her life. The 1779–80 letter-journals are a source of the greatest interest to music historians because of their many accounts of Susan’s visits to the opera and her comments on operas and opera-singers. Curtis Price, Judith Milhous, and Robert D. Hume make extensive use of these journals in their Italian Opera in Late Eighteenth-Century London, i: The King’s Theatre, Haymarket, 1778–1791 (Oxford, 1995), and comment that Susan was “the best critic we have encountered, and by far the most important source on opera in the period.” They continue:

[The 1779–80 letter-journals reveal] a witty and lucid writer, one with good Italian, a technical grasp of music, and an insatiable appetite for rehearsal and backstage gossip. She opens a window for us on the inside of the opera performance world unique for this period.

This study alerted music historians for the first time to the importance of Susan as a writer on music. More recently, Ian Woodfield, in Salomon and the Burneys: Private Patronage and a Public Career (Aldershot, 2003), has turned his attention to the journals of 1787–90, which include not only descriptions of domestic music-making, but also accounts of the music for public performance that she encountered in London on her frequent visits there.

It was a lecture in November 1999 by Kate Chisholm, the author of Fanny Burney: Her Life, 1752–1840 (London, 1998), that first fully alerted me to the unique importance of the letter-journals. Further acquaintance with them led to a growing conviction that they should be published, in whole or in part. The result, some time later, was the setting up of the Susan Burney Letters Project, with the aim of producing a complete web-based edition of the letter-journals and a print edition of selections, drawn from every period of Susan’s life and representing all her activities. Further details are on the web site for the project:

http://www.nottingham.ac.uk/hrc/projects/burney/

The site contains an outline of Susan’s life, the rationale for the project, and four short extracts from the journals, including Pacchierotti’s benefit night at the King’s Theatre, London, on 9 March 1780.

Applications for funding for the project over the last three years have all been unsuccessful. A large part of the problem has undoubtedly been the sheer size of the undertaking: the letter-journals amount to around 650,000 words, and to produce a complete electronic edition and a print edition of selections would require the employment of two post-doctoral research assistants for three years. Perhaps not surprisingly, funding bodies have regarded the cost as too high, given Susan’s relatively unknown status and competing calls on their limited resources. As I write, the project as originally conceived remains in limbo. However, I am exploring the possibility of proceeding with the print edition of selections on its own. This would be a far smaller and more manageable project, and would result in a volume that would still be of value and interest to a wide range of readers.

Artaria Editions

Artaria Editions, under the editorship of Allan Badley, is a New Zealand-based publishing house that specializes in music of the eighteenth and early-nineteenth centuries. Among the most interesting publications issued this year is a reconstructed edition by Robert Hoskins’s of Polly, the sequel to The Beggar’s Opera in the adaptation of 1777 made by Samuel Arnold and George Colman for the Little Theatre in the Haymarket. Artaria has also completed its publication of the chamber music of William Shield with the release of the nine string trios composed in Rome in the early 1790s. The Artaria catalog also includes numerous works by such important eighteenth-century composers as Wanhal, Kraus, Hoffmeister, Saint-Georges and Hummel. The complete catalog is available at www.artaria.com.
Eighteenth-Century Operas
at Caramoor Summer Festival
July 2004
Bruce C. MacIntyre

Each summer the Caramoor International Music Festival (www.caramoor.org) takes place on the beautiful grounds of the former Rosen estate near Katonah, New York, about an hour’s drive north of Manhattan. Since 1979 the festival has established a tradition of performing lesser-known operas, usually accompanied by the Orchestra of St. Luke’s. Caramoor’s new chief executive is Michael Barrett, a protégé of Leonard Bernstein. Bel Canto’s opera productions are effectively semi-staged in Caramoor’s outdoor Venetian Theater. Feathered friends from the thick surrounding woods can be heard adding their occasional chirpings to the al fresco ambience.

In 2004 Bel Canto Opera’s offerings included three rarities under the general theme “Three Legends.” On 10 July, the company presented a magnificent performance of Gluck’s rarely performed Paride ed Elena under the able direction of con­ductor and musicologist Will Crutchfield. They also performed Francesco Conti’s Don Chisciotte in Sierra Morena (1719) and a work by Pauline Viardot.

Paride ed Elena premiered at Vienna’s Burgtheater on 3 November 1770 with a star-studded cast that included the castrato Giuseppe Millico. This last of Gluck’s three Italian reform operas demonstrates through gorgeous music and dance how Paris, the Trojan, managed to win the heart of and elope with Helen of Sparta, the most beautiful woman in the world. The company’s performance of the five-act opera was done in three acts, with the original third act remaining the middle act. With a minimum of cuts, it lasted just under three hours. The orchestra’s spirited playing of the several programmatic balli made up for the absence of dancers. The extended music for the spectacle of the third act’s games, however, certainly cried out for more pantomime than was observed here.

Paride is a timbral challenge for modern audiences because all four of its principals are essentially sopranos. Except for several stirring choruses and one tenor solo, there is little contrast in vocal register. This heightened the challenge that Gluck and Calzabigi had to meet as, according to their foreword to the first published edition of the opera, the knight, who has been trapped in a cage, sings a delight­fully accompanied recitative.

As expected, the knight errant and his sidekick Sancio Panza enjoyed some twenty-five productions elsewhere during the next eighteen years. As Crutchfield notes about Conti, the work certainly whets the appetite for an exploration of his other operas. Let us all look forward to more operatic rarities in future summers at Caramoor! Their performances are definitely worth seeing and hearing.
Salieri in Milan
John A. Rice

For several years Milan’s venerable Teatro alla Scala has been closed while an army of workmen have refurbished the auditorium and completely replaced the back-stage areas, installing state-of-the-art machinery in a huge structure that now rises high above the theater’s elegant old facade. La Scala reopened on 7 December 2004 with a new production of the opera whose performance had celebrated the inauguration of the theater in 1778, Salieri’s Europa riconosciuta. The theater’s music director Riccardo Muti showed courage in choosing a work unfamiliar to singers, orchestra, audience and even most music historians. But he and his administrative colleagues badly miscalculated in their choice of personnel.

Salieri, like Gluck, liked to transfer music from one opera to another when an audience was not likely to recognize the borrowing. The fact that he reused very little of Europa in his later Viennese operas—his most important borrowing was that of the overture for Cesare in Farmacusa (Vienna, 1800)—is a reflection of the extraordinary circumstances of the Milanese production, and in particular a cast that consisted of some of Europe’s greatest singers, including two celebrated musici (Gasparo Pacchierotti and Giovanni Rubini) and two coloratura sopranos with the agility and tessitura of the Queen of the Night (Francesca Danzi-Lebrun and Maria Balducci). Also in Milan was Danzi-Lebrun’s husband, the oboe virtuoso Ludwig August Lebrun, and it was to display the conjugal intertwining of high coloratura soprano and oboe that Salieri wrote the opera’s most astonishing vocal and instrumental pyrotechnics, in the aria “Quanto più irato freme.” Instead of assembling a once-in-a-lifetime constellation of brilliant and famous singers (including the two best coloratura sopranos in the world), La Scala engaged a big group of talented newcomers. By double-casting the opera, the management made clear that this production would not involve really great singers, since the Milanese subscribers would not have accepted an arrangement in which half of them heard a “first cast” of stellar quality and the other half a “second cast.” On 13 January 2005, when I attended the tenth performance, the singers were Anna-Kristina Kaappola (Europa), Desiree Rancatore (Semele), Sabina von Walther (Asterio), Ann Hallenberg (Isseo), and Giuseppe Sabbatini (Egisto). They struggled bravely with Salieri’s music but left the audience without the astonishment, joy, and ecstasy that great singers can stir up in the hearts of opera lovers.

Yes, great singers can do that, even when singing Salieri. Cecilia Bartoli’s concert at Carnegie Hall in February 2004, with the Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment, showed that with the right singer and the right orchestra Salieri’s operatic music can be intensely moving and exciting.

Much of the excitement the singers and orchestra at La Scala generated was dissipated by Pier Luigi Pizzi’s ugly, dark, oppressive sets and costumes, involving the most hackneyed Euro-trash clichés—scaffolding all over the stage, Greek soldiers wearing what looked like motorcycle helmets; the only surprise was that no one wore dark glasses—and Luca Ronconi’s perverse stage direction. Under Muti’s energetic baton the orchestra played the overture (a depiction of a storm at sea) with admirable vigor, but this sonic picture was completely contradicted and undermined by the visual image of a ship’s hull—just the empty hull—slowly revolving in the middle of a dark, otherwise empty stage, with a few people standing impassively to one side. One of the most innovative aspects of Mattia Verazi’s libretto is its extensive use of chorus. This production turned a potential strength into a weakness by having the choral singers, dressed in gray suits, sitting motionless and expressionless in rows and staring out at the audience, as if in parody of a meeting of the central committee of the Chinese Communist Party. These automatons rose out of the floor during the climactic moments of Asterio’s great aria “Del morir l’angoscie adesso,” undercutting the energy that poor Sabina von Walther was trying to communicate to the audience as her aria neared its conclusion.

Also in Milan, a Salieri exhibition organized by the Da Ponte Institut of Vienna roughly coincided with the run of Europa riconosciuta. Entitled “Salieri sulle tracce di Mozart” (Salieri in Mozart’s Footsteps), the exhibition occupied a suite of rooms in the Palazzo Reale, a few steps from the Duomo. It presented a comprehensive survey of the composer’s life, as reflected in librettos, printed and manuscript music, letters and other documents, paintings, drawings, and engravings. A catalogue of about 350 pages, published in German and Italian versions, consists largely of essays that vary a great deal in scholarly importance. Many of the color photographs of exhibited items are of extremely high quality.
Jan LaRue’s life-accomplishment stands out as one of the major shaping forces of American musicology in our time. The son of a botanist, Jan was impressed from early childhood with the elegance and explanatory power of scientific methods, and he might have seemed destined to follow in his father’s footsteps. But he had powerful inclinations toward music, and his artistic talents developed promisingly in several directions, including performance (he became an avid performer of the clarinet), conducting, theory, composition, and musicology. Through undergraduate and graduate work at Harvard and Princeton, he enjoyed the opportunity to learn from some of the most prominent figures in the field, including Walter Piston, Roger Sessions, Oliver Strunk, A. Tillman Merritt, and Archibald T. Davison.

The Second World War was a defining experience, as it was for so many of Jan’s generation. Stationed in Okinawa, he found himself in a position not only to serve his country but—on an altogether different front—to examine an indigenous culture and its musical practices; and with an uncanny resourcefulness that was a hallmark of his career, he proceeded to mold his observations into a path-breaking doctoral dissertation.

An underlying theme to this enterprise, an urge to comprehend all aspects of the foreign environment into which he had been transported, bespoke an order-loving, systematic turn of mind that resonated with another abiding interest of his, namely the European Enlightenment, its artistic accomplishments, and its dedication to progress in the service of humanistic goals. Thus by the mid-1950s he had become fully immersed in what was to evolve as the central focus of his scholarly career: the *Drang nach Kontrolle* that he recognized as a cornerstone of European instrumental music in the later 18th century, with its expanding proportions, increasingly detailed hierarchies, elaborate procedures for thematic differentiation, and general emphasis on structural logic. With an iron will to match that of the astonishingly prolific musicians whose work he now sought to understand, he began mapping out a vast program of research, one result of which was to be a pair of comprehensive histories of the eighteenth-century symphony and concerto. The first step was to gain control of the sources—more than a life’s work in itself—and as this preliminary phase progressed, it grew to encompass an immense and indispensable reference tool, a union thematic catalogue of the eighteenth-century symphony, comprising more than 16,000 entries, packed with information on source locations, datings, papers, watermarks, and attributions.

Closely associated with this line of inquiry, yet reaching well beyond its chronological and generic boundaries, was the idea of a comprehensive system of style analysis. Initially tailored to eighteenth-century instrumental music, it developed into a method so carefully structured that it could serve as a means to explain almost any musical phenomenon. As set forth in *Guidelines for Style Analysis* (1970; 2nd. ed. 1990), the concept is deceptively simple at its core, involving five elements, three dimensions, and the ingenious functional distinction between movement and shape. The faultless clarity of the scheme, with its self-explanatory analytical symbols and devices for graphic representation, stands out as a key to its proven success as a basis for many different kinds of analytical endeavor.

Jan’s enthusiasm for research was always matched by an eagerness to share his results. Beginning in the late 1950s with innovative studies on eighteenth-century source problems and analytical methodology, he published a corpus of exemplary essays, each a polished gem of thought and presentation, rock-solid in content and leavened with wit, telling turns of phrase, and unexpected insights. His scholarly appetite readily extended to daunting administrative and editorial tasks, and thankless though many of them were, they led to some of his proudest accomplishments: the monumental *Congress Report of the Eighth Meeting of the International Musicological Society* (1961) and *Aspects of Medieval and Renaissance Music: A Birthday Offering to Gustave Reese* (1966) are masterpieces of their type. (The latter he was fond of calling “BOGR,” pronouncing the acronym with an explosive accent and ending on a growl to convey exasperation but also undeniable satisfaction in an enterprise whose obstacles he had so deftly surmounted.)

Jan was a superb mentor as well as scholar. His lectures overflowed with analytical insight as well as practical wisdom on the perils and joys of European travel and archival study. He succeeded brilliantly in communicating his own scholarly passion to many students and colleagues whose own accomplishments attest to the enduring value of his teachings.

Inevitably, the most ambitious projects were too large and complex to reach completion within a lifetime, but his own recognition of that fact was never a reason to be deterred. His way was to jump in with unbridled zeal, do what he could, and point the way for others to follow. Thus the published writings, crowned by the *Catalogue of 18th-Century Symphonies Vol 1: Thematic Identifier* (1988), are joined by the great analytical and historical works in progress to constitute a foundation on which scholars will be able to build for many years to come.

### Tribute to Jan LaRue (II)

**Paul Bryan**

Jan LaRue’s accomplishments will be extolled by his many students and colleagues who were more fortunate than I because they were his students and communicated with him daily and regularly. He was an outstanding scholar, teacher, and leader whose perceptive and imaginative mind and passionate pursuit of basic sources added new and important dimensions to eighteenth-century scholarship. I am grateful for the marvelous gathering of his most important publications presented in the spring 2001 issue of the *Journal of Musicology*; it enables me to retire the dog-eared collection that I have collected over the years since I lost contact with him.

There is little I can add to the list of accolades for Jan. By the time I entered his scene I might even have been considered a rival. In truth, I was little more than a confused graduate student at the University of Michigan during the post World-War II years while he and his disciples, such as Eugene Wolf, were in Europe gathering information for the Union Thematic Catalogue of symphonies, later published as *A Catalogue of 18th-Century Symphonies* (1988). With little comprehension of what I was asking, I wrote to him and requested information about his findings on the symphonies of Johann Wanhal. His immediate and generous response led me...
to the first train to New York where I could examine and copy the information he had so laboriously gathered and organized on cards. He, furthermore, encouraged me to consult the sources and provided enthusiastic guidance and introduction to the best places to go, including, for example, to the legendary Christa Landon in Vienna who immediately took the Bryans under her wing in many personal as well as musicalological ways. As an added bonus, and as stated in the acknowledgments in my book, “his numerous letters and the gems of wit and wisdom they contained were . . . always informative and uplifting.”

Jan LaRue was my most important mentor. His generosity in spirit as well as fact inspired me and, doubtless, many others. How fortunate we were. Thank you Jan!

---

**Stanley Sadie**

The Society for Eighteenth-Century Music is greatly saddened by the loss of our friend and colleague, Stanley Sadie, on 21 March 2005. With his passing musicology has lost an eloquent spokesperson and a champion of eighteenth-century music. Dr. Sadie’s exceptional achievements will remain as a testament to his dedication to our field. A full tribute will appear in the next issue of the newsletter.

---

**International Conference**

*“Le arti della scena e l’esotismo in età moderna”*  
*Marita Petzoldt McClymonds*

The international conference entitled *Le arti della scena e l’esotismo in età moderna* took place in Naples 6–9 May 2004, sponsored by the Centro di Musica Antica Pietà de’ Turchini. Specialists in seventeenth and eighteenth century music and theater from institutions in Italy, Spain, Germany, Austria, France, Ireland and the United States gathered for the event.

The main musical attraction was a concert production of Gian Francesco De Majo’s *Motezuma* on a libretto by Vittorio Amedeo Cigna-Santi (first performed in Turin for Carnival 1765), presented by the Cappella della Pietà dei Turchini under the direction of Antonio Florio. This performance alone was worth the trip to Naples. The stunningly costumed singers and an able early music ensemble presented stirring performances amidst suitably moody lighting. De Majo, like Jommelli and Traetta, was frequently called upon to compose French-inspired opera for Turin, Vienna, and Stuttgart in the 1760s. His music is both virtuosic and impetuous, and above all deeply emotional. Now that his music is being performed, it should not be long until he becomes a favorite with fans of early opera.

In their conference presentations, participants returned several times to a few of the best known examples of exoticism in opera—Vivaldi’s *Motezuma* and Rameau’s *Les Indes Galantes*. Investigations also ranged far afield, sometimes into relatively unexplored territory such as exoticism in Spanish drama and the librettos of Metastasio.

Several participants examined representations of exoticism in general. Jean François Latterico surveyed the breadth of exotic locations for staged works in sixteenth century Venice, from Japan to Mexico, noting that the music and the scenography might or might not be exotic as well. Sara Mamone considered the role of travel in inspiring exoticism on stage, while Sergio Durante pinpointed specific aspects of exoticism in eighteenth-century performance.

As might be expected, papers on Turkish topics predominated. Claudio Tosi concentrated on the Italian representations of Turkish music. Bruce Alan Brown took examples from Gluck’s *Cynébère assiégée*, Marina Mayrhofer from Salieri’s *Tarare* and *Axar*, and Francesco Bissoli from Pedrotti’s *Tutti in maschera*. Mario Armellini found similar musical gestures depicting Turks from Cavalli and Lully to Handel and Campra, and Cesare Fertonani discussed examples of Turkish music in Vivaldi’s concertos. Diana Blickmann explored similar depictions of Moorish music in Vinci’s and Vivaldi’s settings of Metastasio’s *Didone abbandonata*.

Other papers considered the handling of exoticism or foreignness in characterization and plots, both serious and comic. Naturally comic operas generated parody whether the Turks were in Italy or the Italians in Algiers, as Deirdre O’Grady pointed out. Looking further east, Elisa Grossato found Alessandri’s *La sposa persiana*, and looking to the west, Pierpaolo Polzonetti discussed a comic opera set in North America—Guglielmi’s *La quakera spiritofo*.

Exotic or distant locations, like ancient history and myth, offered the distancing to stage plots that otherwise would have been considered unsuitable. Thus opera in an exotic location like Peru could stage historical instances of religious and cultural intolerance, political injustice, and abuse of power often characteristic of colonialism, even including the death of a heathen hero. Paolo-giovanni Maione presented *Motezuma* as European myth. Nancy D’Antuono and Steffen Voss discussed Vivaldi’s *Motezuma* for Venice, and Margaret Butler explored De Majo’s for Turin. Elena Sala di Felice drew parallels between the French approach to the portrayal of heathens in “Les Incas” in *Les Indes galante* and Italian treatments of the topic. Guido Padoan compared Voltaire’s play *Alzire* with the opera *Alzira* and Lucio Tufano considered Ossianic “primitivism” and the representation of strong passions in *Comoda*. Two horrific but exotic plots of the late-eighteenth century were also highlighted. Paolo Mechelli dealt with the tragedy of *Inés de Castro* and Anthony DelDonna discussed the sacred opera *Debora e Sisara* of Sernicola and Guglielmi.

Exotic enchantresses also commanded the stage. Melania Bucciarelli found numerous spin-offs from Tasso’s *Gerusalemme liberata* in the Venetian repertory during the first quarter of the eighteenth century. Mario Domenichelli looked at the exotic aspects of Shakespeare’s *Anthony and Cleopatra*, while Wendy Heller discussed Cleopatra as portrayed in *Cesare in Egitto*.

A number of papers addressed exoticism in the spoken theater, including those by Ignacio Arellano, Maria Morrás, Felipe Pedraza Jiménez and Agustín de la Granja. Francesco Coticelli found some exotic episodes in the dramas of Francesco Cerlone. Carlos Mata Indurain described exoticism in the comedy burlesque of Siglo de Oro, and Silvia Carandini discussed masked representations of the East in *commedia dell’arte*. In papers discussing exoticism in operatic staging, Maria Ines Aliverti discussed stage settings by Jean-Nicolas Servandoni, and Francesca Seller and Antonio Caroccia showed examples of exotic bands that appeared on stage.
at the Teatro San Carlo during the eighteenth century.
In addition to the concert that served as the centerpiece of the event, the attendees were treated to memorable performances by Duo Vrenna–Sqillante and Ensemble Dissonanzen.

New Books on Eighteenth-Century Topics


Focusing on Gennaro Magri’s Trattato teorico-prattico di ballo (Naples, 1779), this collection of essays explores Magri’s theatrical career in Naples, Vienna, and other cities, incorporating perspectives from other dancers and writers on theatrical dance. Contributors include (in addition to the editors) Kathleen Kuzmick Hansell, Salvatore Bongiovanni, Sandra Noll Hammond, Linda Tomko, Carol Marsh, Moira Goff, and Patricia Rader.


Words About Mozart is published as a tribute to Stanley Sadie, musicologist, critic, and editor of The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians.

Of the eleven essays presented here, three focus on compositional matters: Julian Rushton examines the dramatic meaning of a recurring motif in Idomeneo; Elaine Sisman sifts through the facts surrounding the genesis of Mozart’s ‘Haydn’ quartets; and Simon Keefe matches up pairs of piano sonatas and concertos on the basis of their common compositional features. Cliff Eisen considers some problems of performing practice posed by the solo keyboard parts in Mozart’s concertos, and Robert Philip surveys tempo fluctuations in a selection of historical recordings. Felicity Baker’s detailed analysis of aspects of the Don Giovanni libretto is a welcome contribution from the field of literary criticism. Three studies offer new archival research: Neal Zaslaw uncovers the background to one of Mozart’s nonsense compositions; Dorothea Link examines the Viennese Hofkapelle and creates a new context for understanding Mozart’s appointment; and Theodore Albrecht proposes a candidate for Mozart’s Zauberflößter. Christina Bashford considers an aspect of Mozart reception in nineteenth-century England connected with John Ella. Peter Branscombe adds a comprehensive overview of research published since the bicentenary in 1991.

The volume includes full bibliography of Stanley Sadie’s publications and broadcasts.

Members interested in reviewing these or other books for the newsletter should contact the SECM newsletter editor at mbutler@music.ua.edu.

Rosetti-Festtage June 2005

Günther Grünsteudel

The sixth Rosetti-Festtage, sponsored by the International Rosetti Society, will be held in the Nördlinger Ries, 4–12 June 2005. The program comprises seven events. Central to this festival as always is the music of Antonio Rosetti (ca. 1750–1792), esteemed in the late eighteenth century throughout Europe. Rosetti spent most of his life at the court of Prince Kraft Ernst zu Oettingen-Wallerstein in the Nördlinger Ries of Bavaria. In addition, there is a rare opportunity to hear the music of other underrated composers of the classic and romantic eras, this year including Ignaz Holzbauer (1711–1783), Ferdinand Ries (1748–1838), Franz Danzi (1763–1826), Conradin Kreutzer (1780–1849) and the two Wallerstein musicians, Johannes Amon (1763–1825) and Friedrich Witt (1770–1836). And, of course, the Vienna classicists Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven are not overlooked. Included on the program of the closing orchestral concert is Haydn’s Symphony in E-flat Major (Hob. I: 91), commissioned by Prince Kraft Ernst zu Oettingen-Wallerstein. The parts for this symphony that Haydn sent to Wallerstein are preserved today in the court music library.

Half of the ensembles this year will be performing on original instruments. These include the ensemble “La Fortune” from Zürich, a wind octet composed of members of leading Swiss orchestras; the Schuppanzigh-Quartett led by the violinist Anton Steck; and the Ensemble Trazom, a Keyboard Trio that was heard in the Rosetti-Festtage of 2002. Also featured will be the Swiss Wind Ensemble, which under the direction of Johannes Moesus will perform Rosetti’s Partita “La Chasse” and Mozart’s “Grande Partita” on modern instruments. The renowned Consortium Classicum led by the clarinetist Dieter Kloecker, who has performed several times at the Rosetti-Festtage, will be heard in septets for strings and winds. The closing concert will feature the Kurpfalz Chamber Orchestra conducted by the festival’s artistic director, Johannes Moesus. The flutist Bruno Meier and the bassoonist Albrecht Holder will be heard as soloists in two concertos by Rosetti. Complementing this program will be a lecture by musicologist Christoph Meixner, who will speak about the festivities on the occasion of the wedding of Prince Kraft Ernst zu Oettingen-Wallerstein with the Princess Maria Theresia von Thurn und Taxis in the year 1774.

Like last year the concerts will be arranged in a group of impressive historical performance spaces, the palaces of Oettingen, Amerdingen, and Baldern, and the Bastei in Nördlingen (as an open-air concert inside the historic city walls). A detailed program and further information is available from the Gesellschaft der Internationalen Rosetti-Gesellschaft, c/o Günther Grünsteudel, Nebelhornstrasse 1, D-86391 Stadtbergen; e-mail: gg@rosetti.de.

Translated by Sterling Murray
A great psychological burden can weigh on graduate students when the time comes to commit to a specific thesis topic; one is ultimately placing one’s career in a definite sub-category of musicology. What sorts of factors can affect one’s choice? Increasingly among my peers, the overwhelming determining factor seems to be methodology. As we have all observed, musicology now encompasses an increasing number of methodologies, partly due to the surge in interest in cultural studies and literary theory, and partly due to the great foundation of source studies created by the field in the twentieth century. As a result, strictly archival research is no longer the most likely option, nor the most preferred, among my generation. There are certainly those of us who enjoy engaging with primary sources, but the goals for such enterprises can vary widely from person to person. Some are interested in situating music in more broad aesthetic trends of the time, some in the historiography of a particular topic, some in documenting the cultural activities of a particular institution, and many in the variable combinations of these areas.

The absolutely crucial question that students seem to be asking themselves across the field is why, and it is the forming of this question that determines one’s methodology. If one is motivated to ask “why has this composer been ignored?” then the search for an answer will lead to historiography and document studies. “Why was this style so prevalent?” leads to studies of aesthetics, music theory, and the dissemination of music. “Why are the love relationships in this opera portrayed as they are?” may call on queer theory, while “why do the characters miscommunicate?” may call on literary theory and analysis. The list goes on. In fact, for every possible question, there is a particular methodology. Though the questions are disparate, however, they all involve a wish to motivate one’s work by deeper inquiries first, and theoretical constructs second.

We all tend to categorize inquiries into two general types: source-based and theory-based work, or—to use some terms that are perhaps outdated—positivist work and new-musicological work. But how do we sort new work into such sharply-drawn categories? Into which category would the questions above fall? Is analysis theory- or source-based? Are writings on aesthetics theoretical or are they sources when contemporaneous? As usual when one examines synthetic categories closely, here these types show their boundaries to bleed. Perhaps we are now living in a “post-new-musicology” world?

Regardless of our methodological categories, the facts regarding dissertations on the eighteenth century are clear: there are few. In fact, only a handful of them have been written in the last five years, according to Doctoral Dissertations in Musicology on-line (http://www.music.indiana.edu/ddm). This is an era that offers a rich array of source materials (particularly for the first half of the century) but one that has been largely untouched by theoretical work. Ironically, in fact, the countries with the richest print cultures at the time, Britain and France, have been relatively neglected in the field to date, leaving room for a great deal of source- and theory-based inquiries.

Unfortunately, some musicologists in both older and newer generations fail to see that these two kinds of work are oftentimes indistinguishable. The problem is in recognizing that the most fruitful kind of archival work is not without theory, while the most provocative kind of theoretical work is not without sources. That is to say that those of us in the younger generation must recognize that archivists do ask themselves deeper questions regarding the importance of their work. In fact, as we all now recognize, the importance of this work is that it provides a broad foundation, on top of which more elaborate and reflective studies may be raised.

Handel in Performance

Robert Balchin

On the evening of Tuesday, 5 October 2004, a modest but enthusiastic audience, including several leading Handelians, gathered at the British Library Conference Centre to hear the first of this season’s Saul Seminars: Studies in Recorded Music. It was given by the distinguished conductor, keyboardist and scholar Christopher Hogwood and introduced by Tim Day, Curator of Western Art Music in the British Library Sound Archive. The seminar’s theme, Handel in Performance, led to its provocative title “Getting a Handle on Handel.” Hogwood took as his starting-point a quotation from The Musical Times written after a concert given in Birmingham in 1849: “How differently is the Messiah now performed—how much is it improved from the work which the composer left!”

The seminar opened with some remarks on the enduring popularity of Handel’s music and the peculiar qualities of Englishness and manliness it was widely held to embody. A playlist of 51 items was distributed, including recordings dating from 1888 to 1997 and from every decade of the twentieth century. The main works featured were Messiah, Israel in Egypt, the concerto grosso op.6 no.5, the Water Music, and Music for the Royal Fireworks. Although many of the chosen excerpts were brief, it proved impracticable to play, let alone discuss, them all in the time available. In fact the entire seminar could easily have been devoted to Messiah alone.

Hogwood remarked that in the course of more than 100 years it was difficult to trace a consistent direction in the recordings, al-
though certain trends were observable. Those from early in the twentieth century gave no impression of the size of the choirs involved: until the 1950s at least, 250 would have been considered a small choir. Traditional amateur choral societies always produced a similar sound, and only with the smaller, more professional choirs of recent years did it become possible to approach the authentic effect of an all-male chorus. We began with two starkly contrasting recordings of “Moses and the Children of Israel” from Israel in Egypt. The first was conducted by August Manns at the Crystal Palace in 1888 with a chorus of over 3000 voices, and the second by Andrew Parrott a century later with the Taverner Choir and Players, well-known for their one-to-a-part Bach cantatas.

Various changes in performance practice were also discussed. A surprising degree of rubato, easily mistaken for waywardness of tempo, was evident in recordings from the 1920s under Thomas Beecham and Malcolm Sargent. At cadences a pronounced ritardando became normal, partly through Hamilton Harty’s arrangements of the suites, which were published around the same time and much recorded in subsequent decades. In deference to Arnold Dolmetsch, overtures were generally double-dotted, but remained subject to wide variations in speed; here Charles Mackerras introduced extensive ornamentation and Hogwood favored plenty of open air. Regarding vocal variants, the text of the Messiah arias had been standardized by the Novello edition of 1847, but the use of appoggiaturas disappeared only in the mid-twentieth century, to re-emerge more recently. Mackerras’s recordings also featured elaborate vocal ornamentation—clearly pre-planned—in the recitatives. Controversy still surrounded Winton Dean’s well-researched assertion that cadential chords should coincide with, rather than follow, the closing notes of the vocal line.

The expansion of orchestral forces to match vast choruses began with the Handel Commemoration of 1784, yet there Handel’s preferred formula of one oboe to four violins was maintained, according to Charles Burney. Nineteenth-century symphonic orchestrations such as Ebenezer Prout’s were designed to address the same problem of balance but with less respect for the composer’s intentions. In the 1930s audiences were introduced to the sound of smaller instrumental forces by ensembles such as the Boyd Neel Orchestra and the Busch Chamber Players, whose versions of the concerti grossi were made on either side of World War II. However, as late as 1950 Ralph Vaughan Williams in his inimitable manner recorded a talk on Bach decrying the use of Baroque instruments and other practices stemming from a pernicious Germanic influence. In retrospect, 1959 could be seen as the high-water mark of the old style, when recordings of Messiah appeared under Beecham (using Eugene Goossens’s orchestration) and Hermann Scherchen with the Vienna State Opera Orchestra, the latter notable for an incredibly slow Pastoral Symphony.

The tide began to turn in the 1960s, which saw the issue of Mackerras’s Messiah with the English Chamber Orchestra and Neville Marriner’s concerti grossi with the Academy of St. Martin-in-the-Fields. Since then, the authentic manner—although purged of its early excesses—had clearly become the norm under conductors including Simon Preston, Ton Koopman, Roger Norrington, Parrott and Hogwood himself. A detailed comparison of their Handel recordings, not to mention the unfeatured work of William Christie, John Eliot Gardiner, Roy Goodman, Nikolaus Harnoncourt and Trevor Pinnock, could form the subject of several further seminars.

---

**Upcoming Concerts**

Carolina Baroque, Dale Higbee, Music Director  
2004–05 Salisbury Bach & Handel Festival  
St. John’s Lutheran Church, 200 W. Innes Street, Salisbury, NC  
Free admission—Donations gratefully accepted  

[www.carolinabaroque.org](http://www.carolinabaroque.org)  
info@carolinabaroque.org

Concert #3: “German Genius: Bach & Handel”  
Friday, May 13, 2005, 7:30 PM

Performers include Teresa Radomski, soprano; Dale Higbee, recorders; Nicolae Soare, baroque violin; Gretchen Tracy, baroque cello; Susan Bates, harpsichord

**Works will include:**

- Handel: Three Soprano Arias from “Chandos” Anthems  
- J. S. Bach, Sonata No. 2 in D major for harpsichord and cello, BWV 1028  
- Handel: Opera Flavio, HWV 16, Act II, Scene 11, Aria “Ma chi punir desi”  
- Handel: Sonata in D major for violin and continuo (harpsichord & cello), HWV 371  
- J. S. Bach: Easter Oratorio, BWV 249, Aria “Seele, deine Spezereien”  
- Handel: Opera “Imeneo,” HWV 41, selected arias

Carolina Baroque is pleased to announce the availability of its newest CD, “Handel Sonatas & Telemann Quartets,” CB-119. Please consult the Carolina Baroque Web site for ordering information.

---

**Member Discount on Journal of Musicology**

The Society for Eighteenth-Century Music has arranged a discount for its members who would like a subscription to the Journal of Musicology. Visit [www.californiajournals.com/jm](http://www.californiajournals.com/jm) and use the discount code SECM20.

---

**Discount on Titles from Oxford University Press**

Oxford University Press has generously offered a discount to society members on selected titles. Please see the list at [www.oup.com/us/catalog/general/subject/?view=usa&cp=24003](http://www.oup.com/us/catalog/general/subject/?view=usa&cp=24003). Members interested in reviewing any of these or other new books on eighteenth-century topics for the newsletter should contact the newsletter editor at mbutler@music.ua.edu.
musical events, called “Day-books”), scholars have been slow to realize the value of the extensive archives in Herrnhut for research on the church’s musical practices. Among the materials in the archive are writings by Zinzendorf, stating his philosophy on music and how music was to be used in worship services, as well as accounts by contemporary observers of the *Singstunden* and other occasions where music was performed. These accounts contain valuable information about how the hymn repertory was assimilated and memorized, as well as how improvisation was accomplished. There are also letters from church elders and notes from synod meetings, which clarify the place of music in Moravian worship services. In addition, I discovered several guides that describe how a *Singstunde* was to be assembled. There are also original manuscripts of the hymn texts and chorale tunes used for the *Singstunden*, as well as several hundred folios of hymn sketches made by Zinzendorf and other community members, revealing the compositional patterns used in constructing new hymns. Most important of all are the transcriptions of actual *Singstunde* services from the period of 1743–1748, which are contained in hand-copied manuscripts of Zinzendorf’s sermons. Some of these services are actually marked by the scribe as having been originally improvised. Thus, in reconstructing this practice, I can rely on a written record made by contemporary observers and participants.

Understanding this now forgotten oral tradition will elucidate music’s integral function in maintaining the values of eighteenth-century religious utopian communities such as Herrnhut. Reconstructing the *Singstunde* tradition will also provide new insights into the role of improvisation and the techniques of the *ars memoriae* in an eighteenth-century written culture.